Project Control and EVM Analysis with Risks and Uncertainties

Lev Virine, Ph.D., P.Eng. Intaver Institute Inc. Calgary, Canada





Why Project Control with Risk Analysis?





New York East Side Access Project

Extension the Long Island Railroad (LIRR) from Queens into a new station under Grand Central Terminal on Manhattan's East Side.



Map of the project: Line Length is 2 miles



East Side Access is considered to be one of the most expensive tunning projects in history per mile.

East Side Access cost

estimates over time

from USD \$5.3B in 2002

to USD \$11.2B in 2021

East Side Access: Queens



East Side Access: Manhattan







New York East Side Access Project

Manhattan's East Side terminal design and actual station in Summer 2022









New York East Side Access Project

Main reasons behind significant cost overrun:

Mismanagement Lack of oversight Fraud

Actual problems with the project:

- High payments to contractors, issues with bidding process
- Politically connected unions
- High profit of design and construction companies
- Design mistakes and design changes
- Problems related to cooperation with other agencies (e.g. Sunnyside Yard)
- 15-25% contingency due to bureaucracy





Manhattan's East Side terminal design



Moynihan Train Hall, New York

Expansion of Pennsylvania Station (the main intercity and commuter rail station in New York) into the city's former main post office building:



- <u>First phase</u>: an expansion of a concourse under the Farley Building, started in 2010 and was completed in June 2017.
 - Second phase: a train hall commenced in 2017 and was opened January 1, 2021.

Total Construction Cost \$1.6B



Cost estimate in December 2002 was \$315 million



California High Speed Rail



<u>Project Cost Escalation</u>
2012 - \$68.4B
2018 - \$77B in year-of-expenditure dollars, assuming a 2033 completion year
3% inflation

Comparing per kilometer cost in US and other regions California High Speed Rail (2014): \$56 million China per kilometer cost: \$17–21 million Europe per kilometer cost \$25–39 million



Comparing Two Projects: Toronto vs. Addis Ababa LRT

Toronto Eglinton Crosstown LRT



- 19 kilometres
- 25 stations
- 2019 Cost: 12.6B
- 12 years to build
- Average construction worker salary: ~CAD \$45,000

Addis Ababa LRT



- 17.4 kilometres (10.8 mi)
- 39 stations
- 2015 Cost: CAD ~0.6B, 21 times more expensive
- 3 years to build
- Average construction worker salary ~CAD \$3,000





Construction Cost Growth Faster Than Inflation



Global Commercial Real Estate Services (CBRE):

- For June 2022 new Construction Cost Index forecasts a 14.1% year-over-year increase in construction costs by year-end 2022 due to labor and material costs continuing to grow. However, the year 2022 is unusual due to high inflation.
- In 2023 and 2024 the cost Construction Cost Index should stabilize to 2%-4% and become close to the historical average.
- The average U.S. inflation in 2020-2021 was 4.1%.





Average Cost of Transit Projects per km in 2000-2025



- Cost growth of transit projects are around 4.8% on average until 2023 and 4.3% until 2021.
- The average world inflation rate from 2000-2021 was 3.35%





0

Correlation Between Construction Worker Wages and Constriction Cost











Three Components of EVM

Project schedule

Value of Planned Work Indicators

Indicators How Much Work Was Performed

Includes necessary tracking information, such as percent completed for each task Includes indicator as Planned Value (PV) or Budgeted Cost of Work Scheduled (BCWS) Includes Earned Value (EV) or Budgeted Cost of Work Performed (BCWP)





Most Used EVM Metrics for Risk Analysis



earned value (EV)

planned value (PV)

The Cost Performance Index (SPI) =

earned value (EV)

actual cost (PV)



Creating the baseline spend plan (BCWS/PV)

Risk Register

Project Schedule (Resource and Cost Loaded)

Workflow $ imes$		Filter Show All	DJ N	o Hierarchy	•	Pre-/Post Mitigation Baselines	Workflow $ imes$		Task Name 💌	Low D 🔻	Base [👻	High D 🔻			-	2014	_
Schedule 🔺			•				Schedule 🔺		- Rusiness Analysis		89 days		Sep (Jct Nov	Dec	Jan Feb	
🗧 Project View							Toject View	2	Launch Busines		4 days						r 👘
🕵 Resources		Risk Name 💌	Oper 🔻	Risk/Issue 🔻	Threat/C 🔻	Risk Assigned To F	🔹 Resources	3	Start Creation	0 days	0 days	0 days					
	1	Cost information is not available	Open	Risk	Threat	Assigned to 2 tasks/resource		4	Meet to discus	3 days	3 days	4 days		Product [)evelopmen	Manager(20%)	Financ
Cost and income	2	Delay in Financing	Open	Risk	Threat	Task 55:		5	Divide Busines	1 day	1 day	1 day		Produc	t Developm	ent Manager(20%	(a) Fina
🗱 Work	3	Delay in getting level advice	Open	Risk		Task 29: ASSIGNINIS		6	Market Analysis	i day	40 days	, duy				sint manager(207	,,, ma
	4	Delay in patent and trademark search	Open	Risk		Task 28: Tasks a	nd	7	B Who are the		30 days				_		
	5	Lack of knowledge of the specific area	Open	Risk		All resou		8	Start Custo	0 dave	0 days	0 dave			•		
Risk Register	6	Not enough data to analyze demand level	Open	Risk	Threat	Task 21: Resour	Ces ster	-	Develop a (10 days	10 days	10 dave		Brot	fuct Develo	ment Manager(1	0%) E
🚔 Risk Dashboard	7	Not enough data to plan management of demanc	Open	Risk	Threat	Task 23:	201 1	10	What is the	0 days	10 days	12 days			Bueineee /	naturet(20%) Eine	
💿 Risk Report	8	Not enought information about competitors	Open	Risk		Assigned to 3 tasks/resource	Risk Report	11		3 days	10 days	12 days			Business A	analyst(2016),1116	Dred
	9	Other risks, related to the project	Open	Risk	+ Threat	All tasks global)		42	Flow call y	TU days	TO days	TO days				ss Analyst(20%)	Produ
Risk Assignments	10	Problem with hiring	Open	Risk		Task 58: Hiring of key employ	I RISKASS Nº .nts	12	Finish Cust	0 days	0 days	0 days			<u> </u>		
📭 Drag N' Drop Risk	11	Resource Risks	Open	Risk			📭 Drag N' Drop Risk	13	- Who will be y		40 days				_		
Mitigation Response	12	Risks affecting whole company/division	Open	Risk	+ Threat	All tasks (global)	Mitigation Desponse	14	Start Comp	0 days	0 days	0 days					
	13	Selected name is taken	Open	Risk	+ Threat	Task 28: Establish Name and	20 miligation, receptinge	15	Who are yc	10 days	10 days	10 days			ect Manager	r(10%),Financial	Analy
🐢 Assign Mitigation	14	Staff turnover	Open	Risk	+ Threat	All resources (global)	莎 Assign Mitigation	16	How effect	15 days	15 days	15 days			Business	Analyst(10%),F	nanci
Risk Status							Risk Status	17	Will you be	13 days	15 days	17 days			₽u	isiness Analyst(2	20%),F
- Diak Matrix						_	Diek Matrix	18	📃 Finish Com	0 days	0 days	0 days			•		
KISK Mau K		1				▼	RISK Mau K	19	🖃 🗖 What will be		35 days						
Risk Trend		Default					Risk Trend	20	Start Analysis	0 days	0 days	0 days		•			T
	(+)	Click [+] to create new view	s with c	istomized sets	ot columns ar	d filters						Þ	•				



Perform Monte Carlo





Risk Adjusted Project Schedule with Certain Confidence Level (e.g., 80%)

🕞 - 🖪 -							Risky	Project Pr	ofession	al - [RP_Bu	sinessPlan_Tra	ick2]						— C	x u	
FILE * SCHEDULE	RISKS	ANALY	sis t	RACKING	REP	ORT 1	OOLS												? 🖵 i	
Paste ↓ Cut ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓	dule and	로 특 d Calendar	B Z ⊒- ⊒-	U ■ IIIII	= = M	Project R View	esources Schedul	Cost and Income	Work	Calculate	Week	▼ A AA 2 nd Find	Uutline	Schedule Diagnostics	Project Setti Project Opti Settings and Op	ngs ons tt Bar tions	➡ Set ➡ Manage Baselines			'
Workflow $ imes$		Tas	k Name	-	Succe 💌	Low Di 👻	Base D	er, 2013	0 27	November, 2	2013 D	ecember, 201	13	January, 2	12.					l .
Schedule 🔺	1	🗆 🗖 Bus	iness An	alvsis			89 da		0 27	03 10	17 24 01	08 15	22 29	05 1	~					
🗧 Project View	2		aunch Bu	isiness			4 day	—							C	om	ipiete	ed la	SK	
🎎 Resources	3	-	Start Cr	eation of	94.0%	0 days	0 day		Ť											
Cost and Income	4		Meet to	discuss ı	94.0%	3 days	3 day													
	5	-	Divide B	usiness	94.0%	1 day	1 da													
28: WORK	6	- 🗖 N	Aarket Ar	nalysis			40 da		¥—					_	Dartia	llvz	Com	nlota	d Ta	ck
Risks 🔺	7		Who ar	e the cu			30 da		-					•	railla	пу	COIII	piece	u la	SK
Risk Register	8		Start	Custome	94.0%	0 days	0 day		•											
喜 Risk Dashboard	9		Deve	elop a de:	94.0%	10 days	10 da		+		_									
T Diak Dapart	10		Wha	t is the pr	94.0%	9 days	10 da						1							
	11		How	can you	94.0%	10 days	10 da				•	, i		ካ						
Risk Assignments	12		Finis	h Custor	94.0%	0 days	0 day						•	ř.	1					
📭 Drag N' Drop Risk	13		Who w	Compoti	04.09/	0 dava	40 da								Тас					~+
📣 Mitigation, Response	15		Who	are your	94.0%	0 days	10 da		_	_	,				las	K IS	s not	start	ea y	et
TO Assiss Militation	16		How	effective	94.0%	15 days	15 da					→ ↔								
20 Assign mugation	17	-	Willy	ou be cc	94.0%	13 davs	15 da						_1	\checkmark						
Risk Status	18		Finis	h Compe	94.0%	0 days	0 day					+			Į					
Risk Matrix	19		What w	rill be Yo			35 da	,						•						
Risk Trend	20		📃 Start	Analysis	94.0%	0 days	0 day	•	• •											
A	21		📄 Wha	t is the de	94.0%	5 days	5 day			_										
	22		📃 Wha	t is the de	94.0%	10 days	10 da												1	
Result Gantt	23		📄 How	will you	94.0%	20 days	20 da				+		h		_ ()rie	vinal	Dura	tion	
 Project Summary 	24		📄 Finis	h Analys	94.0%	0 days	0 day					•	→			31.12				
🧉 Cost Analysis	25		Busines	s Plan Re	94.0%	0 days	0 da					•					(no	risks)		
🕌 Cash Flow	26		evelop G	eneral (35 da													
	27		Start An	alysis	94.0%	0 days	0 day	• •	1	↓	4								-	
	I						Ē												١	1
Ready														Result Gant			M SCRL Mon,	Oct 09,2023 8	15:25 AM	R



Measuring actual project performance and forecast future project outcome (EAC)







Measuring actual project performance and forecast future project outcome (EAC)

- Select EVM metrics, for example CPI and SPI to trigger corrective action in risk process and calculate them.
- **Consider modifications to risk processes**, for example perform risk mitigation if CPI and/or SPI cross thresholds.
- **Consider the need to review initial baseline or scope** if CPI and/or SPI persistently have unusually high or low values.





Risk Mitigation Process







Risk Mitigation Waterfall

Risk Information

ne: Delay in Financ	sing			Risk II	D: R00	000013					Copy	y to Clij
eat	Mitigation Plan	Start	Start Actu	Probabili l	Impact: A	Score: A	Cost (Mitiga	Cost Actual	Assigned to	% Compl	Associated T	Fask
Mitigation	1 Current	10/18/21		65.0 % 7	73.2 %	47.6 %	\$0.00	\$0.00				
Milgalion	2 Mitigation Plan 1	11/01/21		60.0 %	70.0 %	42.0 %	\$0.00	\$0.00		0.0%		
	3 Mitigation Plan 2	11/15/21		55.0 %	40.0 %	22.0 %	\$0.00	\$0.00		0.0%		
	4 Mitigation Plan 3	11/29/21		50.0 %	30.0 %	15.0 %	\$0.00	\$0.00		0.0%		
ation cost:												
\$0.00												
t-Mitigation												
	•											
	Oct 31,'21	Nov 7,'21		_	No	/ 14,'21	-		Nov 21,'2	1		Nov
		S S M T	- W 1	r F	S S	M	TW	TF	S S N	I T W	TFS	S
tual or/and ne	80%											
2 Actual	60%											
2 Planned	ž 40% 2											
						L.						
	20%					3						—

Mitigation/Response Plan Depository

Risk Mitigation Waterfall Diagram



Risk Mitigation Depository

Riskyl Riskyl	Project Profe	essional - [RP_Busi	nessPlan_Tr	ack2]				_			
FILE * SCHEDULE RISKS ANALYSIS TRACKING REPORT	TOOLS	5							? 🖵 🚺		
Image: Copy Paste Image: Copy Copy Clipboard Image: Copy Clipboard <	Resources (Schedule	Cost and Work Income	() Calculate	Month (R) (R) (R) (R) (R) (• • •	tline Sch Diag	edule nostics Elim Project Se Project Op Settings and Construction	ttings discrete strains	1 Set Manage Baselines		
Norkflow X Risk Mitigation or Response Plan P	Plan Type	Use	ed in risks:		Cost	Cost Actu	al Assigned to	Action P	an 🗖	-	
Schedule 1 Imitigation Plan 1 Mitigation Plan 2 Project View 2 Imitigation Plan 2 Mitigation Plan 2	itigation F itigation F	Risk: Delay in Financ Risk: Delay in Financ	ing ing		\$45,660 \$14,560	\$45,660 \$12,000	Project Manager Business Analyst			1	
🎎 Resources 🛛 3 👰 Mitigation Plan 3 Mit	itigation F	Risk: Delay in Financ	ing		\$7,680.00	\$5,000.00	Project Manager				
Cost and Income A Response Plan 1 Mit	itigation N	ditigation Plan Pro	perties						×		
¥i Work	Г	Mitigation Diana	Mitigation Di	- 2					_		Assig
Risks 🔺	L	Milugaluori Piari:	Milugation Pla	11.5							/
Risk Register									•		
🚑 Risk Dashboard											Proie
Risk Report											
Risk Assignments	l										VV
12 Drag N' Drop Risk	[Select Associated	Task:				Clear ta	al al	_		
Mitigation, Response	ĺ				Task N	lame					
Assign Mitigation		1 🖃 🗖 Bus	iness Anal	ysis				-			
	-	2 🗆 🗖 l	aunch Bus	iness Plan							
	-	4	Start Crea Meet to dis	tion of Business	s Plan iness strate	2014					
Risk Matrix		5	Divide Bus	siness Plan Wor	k by Experi	ence					
Risk Trend		6 -	 Market Ana	lysis							
Analysis 🔺		7 🖃	Who are	the customer	s for your	Business					
Result Gantt		8	📃 Start C	ustomer Analys	is				-		
	L	•						•	-	-	
Ready				OK	і, кезропз	Cancel	CAP NOM SCRE MOT	1, ULL V9,202	► +:21:18 PM		

ning task or project to mitigation plan: ect Cost and Schedule vill be recalculated







Percent Completed Over Time



Basic steps to the EVM/Risk Analysis process



Risk Mitigation Exploiting Opportunities Changing Scope



....

THANK YOU



