

# Project Controls Expo – 13 October 2015 Emirates Stadium, London

# **Scream If You Want To Go Faster**

The contractual, legal, financial and practical aspects of acceleration

# **David Bordoli and Helen Bentley**













# **About David**

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### David Bordoli

**Director - Forensic Delay Analyst** 

- Chartered Builder
- Over 35 years of construction industry experience
  - Academically and professionally qualified
- Co-author of 'A Handbook for Construction
  Planning and Scheduling' (Wiley Blackwell, 2014)
- Experienced expert witness first appointment
  in 1989. Currently involved in a major
  infrastructure arbitration in South Africa
  - Wholly proficient in planning and delay software and applications







# **About Helen**

### Helen Bentley

- **UK Consultancy Director** 
  - Chartered Civil Engineer
- Academically and professionally qualified
- Common sense approach analysis
- Extensive contract administration experience
- Recent live project involvement



- Over 30 years of engineering and construction experience
- Advised on a wide number of contracts including NEC3, PPC2000, JCT, ICE, and bespoke forms of contract.





# **About Driver**

Driver Group provides support to the engineering and construction industries it serves, from start to finish

- Global construction consultancy
- Established in 1978
- Stock exchange listed plc. AIM (2005)
- Market leader in expert witness, planning, commercial, and disputes.
- Over 300 global staff
- Network of offices across Africa, Americas, Asia Pacific, Europe, and the Middle East

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Global reach with projects undertaken worldwide





# **About the Topic**

#### Most construction and engineering projects finish late



Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

#### 

**CITIVET** GLOBAL CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANCY

# **About the Topic**

#### Most construction and engineering projects finish late 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20% 10% 0% 2013/14 2007 2008 2009 2010 2011 2012 Design Construction

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Project Controls

EXPO



# **About the topic**

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

- How do we know where we are?
- How do we know where we are going?
- How do we change where we are going?
- **Acceleration Mitigation Disruption**
- Forms of Contract and what they say
- **Case Law**

**Project controls in action** 





# **Acceleration – Disruption - Mitigation**







### Acceleration

Increasingly an issue, when project completion MUST be achieved on time.

An opportunity and a risk to all parties to the contract....

Accelerate vb.

1. to go, occur or cause to go or occur more quickly; to speed up

- 2. to cause to happen sooner than expected
- 3. to increase the velocity of...







#### The need to accelerate

- Slow release of design information, design changes,
- Changed ground conditions,
- Poor construction or project management of the works,
- Changes or additional works instructed, but without any time extension,
- Employer's instructions to complete the whole or part of the works earlier than planned.

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

[Keane & Caletka 2015]





### Acceleration

#### Acceleration

"The execution of the planned scope of work in a shorter time than anticipated or the execution of an increased scope of work within the originally planned duration."

[Society of Construction Law]

#### **Directed Acceleration**

"The buying back of a time extension due to the contractor under the terms of the contract in an effort to complete the work within the existing contract completion date."

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

[US Army Corps]





# Acceleration

### **Constructive Acceleration**

"Acceleration following failure of the Employer to recognize that the Contractor has encountered Employer Delay for which it is entitled to an EOT and which failure required the Contractor to accelerate its progress in order to complete the works by the prevailing contract completion date. This situation may be brought about by the Emplyer's denial of a valid request for an EOT or by the Employer's late granting of an EOT. Not (currently) a recognized concept under English law."

[Society of Construction Law]

#### **Constructive Acceleration**

"An act or failure by the Employer which does not recognize the Contractor has an entitlement to EoT for an excusable delay, which required acceleration to complete in the existing contract timescale." [US Army Corps]

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved







#### **Acceleration Measures**

- Increased resources
- Increased working hours
- Incentives
- Changed methods of working
- Rescheduling work







#### Disruption

"Disturbance, hindrance or interruption of a Contractor's normal work progress, resulting in lower efficiency or lower productivity than would otherwise be achieved. Disruption does not necessarily result in a Delay to Progress or Delay to Completion."

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

[Society of Construction Law]







#### **Causes of disruption**

- Loss of job rhythm
  - Premature moves between activities
  - Out of sequence working
  - Repeated learning cycles
  - Work area congestion
    - Stacking of trades
    - Increased gang sizes
      - Increased length or number of shifts





### Disruption

#### **Productivity vs increase in size of labourforce**



Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Griver GLOBAL CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANCY

### Disruption

### **Productivity vs working space**



Project Controls E × P O 6





Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

#### **Acceleration Measures**

- Increased resources
- Increased working hours
- Changed methods of working
- Rescheduling work

### Causes of disruption

- Increased gang sizes
- Increased length or number of shifts
- Repeated learning cycles
- Premature moves
  between activities
  Out of sequence working





### Mitigation

### Mitigation

"Mitigate means making less sever or less serious. In connection with Delay to Progress or Delay to Completion, it means minimising the impact of the Risk Event. In relation to disruption or inefficient working, it means minimising the disruption or inefficiency. Failure to mitigate is commonly pleaded as a defence to a claim."

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

[Society of Construction Law]







### **Obligation to mitigate**

- Change the planned sequence of working, but not
  - Reducing productivity (by accelerating)
    - Increase direct costs (additional plant and materials)

- Take steps that require the expenditure of substantial sums
- Do what is commercially practicable
- Do what could reasonably be done in the circumstances











Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### NEC3

#### Clause 36.1

The Project Manager may instruct the Contractor to submit a quotation for an acceleration to achieve Completion before the Completion Date. The Project Manager states changes to the Key Dates to be included in the quotation. A quotation for an acceleration comprises proposed changes to the Prices and a revised programme showing the earlier Completion Date and the changed Key Dates. The Contractor submits details of his assessment with each quotation.







Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### JCT SBC 11

### Provides that:

Project Controls

- Employer can invite proposals
- Contractor identifies time that can be saved and quote, or...
- Says why it can't be done.
- Contract sum adjusted if quote OK, includes loss and expense and cost of quoting.
- Or revised proposals, BUT
- Any work at risk, until instructed





Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### ICC 2011

### Provides that:

- Requires all work to be completed within the contract / extended period.
- If Employer asks for work to be completed in a shorter time and Contractor agrees, then any special terms and conditions of payment shall be agreed before measures taken.







### FIDIC

Provisions vary under different forms...but typically:

- Default by the Contractor within the Red Book:
  - Engineer may instruct issue of revised programme and proposed methods;
  - Measures shall be adopted whether instructed or not;
  - Contractor's risk and liability for cost;
  - If Employer incurs extra cost, Contractor to pay.
- If default by Employer:

**Project Controls** 

Cost of acceleration measures paid by Employer

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Maybe instructed by variation...











### **Key Questions**

- Does the Contractor have the right to accelerate?
- Is the Contractor obligated to accelerate?
- Can an instruction to accelerate be declined?
- Is the Contractor entitled to payment for acceleration measures?

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Important Cases to consider before accelerating the works...







### Contractor's Right To Acceleration

### Glenlion Construction Ltd v Guinness Trust (1987)

- As a Contractor, you ARE entitled to complete a project before the contractual completion date (except in instances where the Contractor's method and programme are part of the contract documents).
- However, the Client is NOT contractually bound to:
  - Accept the built asset any earlier than in their contract,
  - Pay any money for acceleration costs or,
  - Co-operate with the Contractor to enable earlier completion, e.g. issuing drawings earlier than planned.





### Contractor's Duty of Acceleration

British Westinghouse Electric & Manufacturing Co Ltd v Underground Electric Railways Co of London Ltd (1912)

- Imposes a duty on the Contractor to take "all reasonable steps to mitigate the loss consequent on the breach".
- However, the duty does necessitate that the Contractor "take any steps which a reasonable and prudent man would ordinarily take in the course of his business".





### Contractor's Duty of Acceleration

JCT SBC 11: The contractor must "constantly use his best endeavours to prevent delay"

- Regularly and diligently...
  - Best Endeavours...
    - Reasonable endeavours...





### Implied Acceleration

- In a situation where the Contractor is entitled to EoT, but none has been given, he must either accelerate the work to avoid LAD's or complete late and claim the time back from the Employer.
- Accelerating without an official instruction (implied/constructive acceleration) is extremely risky.
- Case Law does however give us an indication into what will happen in such a scenario.





### **Implied Acceleration**

- Five steps to a claim:
  - Must be an excusable delay
  - Must be timely notice of the delay and proper EoT request

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

- EoT request must be postponed or refused
- Employer must act by coercion, direction or a manner construed as ordering completion to original programme
- Contractor must accelerate and incur added cost.

[Bramble & Callahan]





### **Implied Acceleration: Employer**

Motherwell Bridge Construction Limited v Micafil (2002)

- If an Employer is responsible for a delay to a project, does not instruct the Contractor to accelerate, does not give the Contractor an Extension of Time and the Contractor, subsequently, accelerates in an effort to avoid LADs, the Contractor should be paid his acceleration costs.
- But the Contractor does not necessarily need to do this, he could also;

- Request an Extension of Time or,
- Adjudicate on an Extension of Time if refused one.





### **Implied Acceleration: Contractor**

Ascon Contracting Limited v Alfred McAlpine Construction Isle of Man Limited (1999)

- If a Contractor causes a delay to the works by his own actions he/she should not be awarded an Extension of Time.
- If the Contractor then proceeds to accelerate the works, to mitigate his own delays with or without an official instruction, he will not able to claim any acceleration costs.





### **Express Acceleration**

### Norair Engineering v The United States (1981)

- This US case established that even vague statements from the Employer, such as requesting the Contractor to take *"positive action to expedite the work by supplying all materials necessary to accelerate progress"*, constitute an Express Instruction to Accelerate.
- The Express Instruction then creates a right to payment of acceleration costs.




# **Acceleration Case Law**

#### **Express Acceleration**

*Lester Williams v Roffey Brothers & Nicholls (Contractors) Ltd (1989)* 

- If an agreement to accelerate has been agreed and the Employer derives an obvious benefit from the acceleration, the Contractor will be paid his acceleration costs.
- The Employer cannot argue that he is paying you twice for doing the same job.





# **Acceleration quotations under NEC3**

### **PM Instructs a Quotation**

Clause 36.2

The Contractor submits a quotation or gives his reasons for not doing so within the period for reply.

### Clause 36.3

When the Project Manager accepts a quotation for an acceleration, he changes the Prices, the Completion Date and Key Dates accordingly and accepts the revised programme.





# **Acceleration quotations**

### WARNING! Acceleration Costs Will be Different From Costs

As more variable resources are piled onto the same site, they start to lose efficiency:

- Plant starts to get in the way of other site operations and other items of plant.
- Trade Operatives do not have enough time and space to carry out their work in a normal way.
- The site operation will begin to experience the law of diminishing returns i.e. the more resources put into a project, the less the increase output and the more increase in cost







# **Acceleration quotations**





# **Acceleration quotations**

### **Making a Separate Agreement**

- Often a separate agreement is proposed
- Must have provisions to extend time if further events occur. Link to contract?
- Or allocate any risks to the contractor
- What happens if completion is not achieved on time? All or Nothing?
- Must have proper consideration
- Instruction Validity Can the Architect / CA instruct as a VO / Change acceleration where no specific provision exists?

- Warranties to the Employer guaranteeing success.
- Caveats to disclaim liability of failure.







# Project Controls Expo – 13 October 2015 Emirates Stadium, London



# **David Bordoli and Helen Bentley**







# Project Controls Expo – 13 October 2015 Emirates Stadium, London

# **Scream If You Want To Go Faster**

The contractual, legal, financial and practical aspects of acceleration

# **David Bordoli and Helen Bentley**











Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### St. Driver's Academy School (for Gifted Future Surveyors)

- Project Details
  - Type of Contract: NEC Option A
  - Duration: 18 months
  - 28 July Completion
  - Total Cost: £10m
  - £25K p/wk LAD's
  - £100K bonus







### Critical Considerations

- Employer must have project complete by 28 July or funding lost for whole term, possibly year
- Project must be completed on schedule to secure a £100K bonus payment and
- Avoid onerous LADs of £25k / week
  - Standard NEC provisions apply
- Employer has design responsibility not 100% complete, but Architect assures it will be done...





At Contract Award the Contractor is on programme to and is predicted to complete by the completion date stipulated in

the contract



Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved



#### Project Monitoring Dashboard

Project Controls

EXPO



#### Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

CONSULTANCY

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Accurate Project Data Is Essential

- Project Monitoring Provides: Early Warning of late delivery
- Actual Progress / live predictions
- Modelling of acceleration options
- Sets out the possible / impossible

### YOU MUST ALWAYS KNOW WHERE YOU ARE...





Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Delay No 1

Inclement Weather / Flooding

- Generally, events such as extreme flooding are neutral events, in the sense that neither the Employer nor the Contractor is responsible for causing the event (excluding Insurance events)
- Under NEC this may be a compensation event, but not in this instance.



![](_page_49_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_49_Picture_7.jpeg)

#### Project Programme: End Month 2

![](_page_50_Figure_2.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

![](_page_50_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### **Project Dashboard: End Month 2**

![](_page_51_Figure_2.jpeg)

#### Project Controls E × P O Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

![](_page_51_Picture_4.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Delay No. 2

### Contractor culpable:

- Damage to work during construction
- Poor progress / productivity
  - **Re-work & rectification**
- Supply chain delays
  - Design delays in D & B contracts

![](_page_52_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_52_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_52_Picture_10.jpeg)

#### **Project Status: Falling Behind**

ſ						200 2011		
	ine	Name	Duration	Start	End	_bnam Febram Norch keit May Jane Jaka Agast Sestenber October Obereter Denseber Janamy Febram Norch And I Nor Jane Jaka Agast a missioni a förstra at störaste störationa at missioni at störationa at störationa at störation störationa störationa störationa at störationa störationa at störationa störationa at		
ľ	1	Prefab Room Construction	38w 4d	04 Jan 10	07 Oct 10			
	2	Deafah Masufashua Daama	20	04 1 10	07.0-1.40			
	2	Freiab Manufacture Rooms	30W 40	04 Jan 10	07 Oct 10			
	3	Module A1 manufacture	26w 2d	04 Jan 10	14 Jul 10			
	4	Module A4 manufacture	11w 2d	28 Apr 10	20 Jul 10			
	5	OnSite Module Erection	72w 2d	04 Mar 10	15 Aug 11			
	6		51w 5d	04 Mar 10	18 Mar 11			
	7	ine D&	Б.(	<b>FO</b> P	itra	ct states that if the Contractor meets his		
	8	Module A2	26w 1d	01 Nov 10	16 May 11			
Ξ	9	Foundations on the	a	1000	04 - 16	adling of the 29th July it will receive a		
	10	COMP	et	IOI.	1 <u>,</u> Ut	adime of the zoth July, it will receive a		
	11	Foundations	10w	18 Oct 10	04. Jan 11			
	42	Roni	IC	Day	im	ant of £100,000,00. If this completion		
	12	DOIL	12	гау	1110	ent of L100,000.00. If this completion		
	13	Module A4	56w 3d	14 Jun 10	29 Jul 11			
	14	deadl	ine		mi	ssed it will receive no such honus and		
	15	Module MCCpCICI		29 . 11 . 9	29 Jul 1	ssed, it will receive no saen bonds and		
	16	Module A5	51w 6h	09 Apr 10	15 Apr 11			
	17	sufter Liquidated Ascertained Damages (LADs)						
	18	Module A6	55w 3d	14 May 10	24 Jun 11			
	19	Foundations	20w 2d	14 May 10	22 Oct 10			
1	20	Module A5 and A6 complete		24 Jun 11	24 Jun 11			
	21	Module A7	58w 3d	11 May 10	12 Jul 11			
	22	Foundations	14w	11 May 10	15 Feb 11			
	23	Module X1	32w 4d	14 Dec 10	15 Aug 11			
	24	Module A7 and X1 complete		15 Aug 11	15 Aug 11			
	25			15 Aug 14	15 Aug 11			
	25	overan completion		13 Aug 11	13 Aug 11			
						4 M 9 5 A & 5 M & 5 M 9 5 M 9 1 M 9		
	ine	Name	Duration	Start	End	re normen e normen e normen e normen e normen e normen e la presente normen e normen e Lanary Reham March Anni May Jane Jahy August September October Normen e Deerber Janary Reham March Anni May Jane Jahy August e normen e norme e normen e norme e norme e norme e		
-L						2010 2011		

![](_page_53_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### Project Dashboard: Falling Behind

Project Controls

EXPO

New Driver Academy School	Contract N	umber: xxxxxxx Commerc	cial Director	: xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx Progress at: March 20	driver						
Contract Type: Design & Build	Commencement	Completion	Weeks	Into Liquidated Damages							
Contract Period	04 January 2010	28 July 2011	81	Amber = 2% to 3% of Planned Completion							
Revised Contract Period (based on EOT) 04 January 2010		ALCOVED	13	Green = ahead of Planned Completion							
Current Planned Forecast	04 January 2010	06 September 2011	87								
£12.0m Budgeted Cost Of Work Scheduled		Key Risks			0						
£10.0m Actual Cost Of Work Scheduled		Short Term: The module	A1 manufact	ture is severely delayed having a	LADS						
£8.0m Earned Value	A PART			£0.2M							
£6.0m		Long Tormy Fogue an and	the remaining modules to most the								
£4.0m	-	completion date	eleration of	the remaining modules to meet the							
£2.0m		General Comment: Progr	modules continues to slip. The result	30 40 50 60 20							
		being a knock on delay of	eeks. Unless ways to accelerate are	8							
be consistent of the constant		found then LAD's will apply.									
Module internals and M&E. Bank holidays fall into this period. Perhaps this is an oportunity to catch up some previous lost time.											
	-		-	1							
Critical Path					30 40 50 60 20						
This months critical path activities (0 Total Float) no	ow through all module in	nternals and M&E works.									
Silla.	a la como										
					aplemented CE						
inis months near critical path activities (<2 weeks)					premented CE S						
Modulo Status											
	A3 A4	A5 A6	Δ7	X1 KEY							
Eabrication Complete Complete	Complete Complete	Complete Complete	Complete		30 40 50 50						
	complete    complete	complete complete	Somplete	- 2w bellind	8-1						
Foundations Complete Complete	Complete Complete	Complete Complete	Complete	Complete	0 8-						
roundations Complete Complete	Complete Complete	Complete Complete	complete	< Zw berlind	napproved CE's						
Tanta Uniting											
Installation				Un Prog.							

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

#### driver GLOBAL CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANCY

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Delay No 3

Client Design Variations...

- When an Employer impedes the progress of the contractor, it becomes responsible for the delay
  - In this situation, the Employer has two options:
    - Give the Contractor EoT as a compensation event.
    - Arrange acceleration of the works by the Contractor, which the Employer should, subsequently, pay for.

![](_page_55_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_55_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_55_Picture_9.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Current Status

Currently at St. Driver's Academy School

- It is now clear that the project will overrun unless decisive action is taken.
- The Employer is asking what we are doing about the problem...

![](_page_56_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Picture_7.jpeg)

#### Project Status: Falling Behind

![](_page_57_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_57_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_57_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### Project Dashboard: Falling Behind

![](_page_58_Figure_2.jpeg)

#### Project Controls E × P O Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

![](_page_58_Picture_4.jpeg)

### Delays

### Three Different Events Have Caused Delay

![](_page_59_Picture_3.jpeg)

Bad Weather & Flooding **Neutral or** Insurance

![](_page_59_Picture_5.jpeg)

Productivity issues **Contractor** 

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

![](_page_59_Picture_7.jpeg)

Client design changes **Employer** 

![](_page_59_Picture_9.jpeg)

![](_page_59_Picture_10.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### The Quotation is submitted:

- What if the quotation is rejected?
- The instruction is delayed?
- Re-submitted?
- No PM's assessment
- Should we start measures in anticipation?
- Finally the instruction is received...

![](_page_60_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_60_Picture_9.jpeg)

### Contractor Begins Acceleration

![](_page_61_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_61_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_61_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### **Contractor Begins Acceleration**

Project Controls

EXPO

![](_page_62_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_62_Picture_4.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Current Status

- The Contractor's acceleration programme is now in full swing. However, costs are now far higher than the Contractor first estimated.
- Can these costs be recovered?
- Withdrawal of quotes?
- Or stuck with it?

![](_page_63_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_63_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_63_Picture_8.jpeg)

### Mid Acceleration: More Variations

![](_page_64_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_64_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_64_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### Mid Acceleration: More Variations

Project Controls

EXPO

![](_page_65_Figure_2.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

#### driver GLOBAL CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANCY

#### End of July: Deadline Missed

![](_page_66_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_66_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_66_Picture_4.jpeg)

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

### Position at Completion

- Contractor finishes 5 weeks late
  - What does he get paid?
    - No completion bonus
    - LAD's for the over run
      - Acceleration costs in full

![](_page_67_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_67_Picture_8.jpeg)

![](_page_67_Picture_9.jpeg)

### Acceleration

### Conclusions

- Knowledge of current status of works and progress predicted is critical
- Accurate Project Monitoring is needed
- Contractor has no 'right of acceleration'
- Contractor has obligations to progress, which may include acceleration

Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved

Reasonable / Best endeavors

![](_page_68_Picture_7.jpeg)

![](_page_68_Picture_8.jpeg)

### Acceleration

### Conclusions

- Most standard forms now have provision.
- Provisions for EOT need to still apply
- Express Acceleration Contractor cost recovery is likely when instructed and agreed in clear terms
- Constructive Acceleration extremely difficult to succeed on – Possible only in very rare circumstances

![](_page_69_Picture_6.jpeg)

![](_page_69_Picture_7.jpeg)

### **Any Questions?**

![](_page_70_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_2.jpeg)

![](_page_70_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_71_Picture_0.jpeg)

# Project Controls Expo – 13 October 2015 Emirates Stadium, London

![](_page_71_Picture_2.jpeg)

# **David Bordoli and Helen Bentley**

![](_page_71_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_71_Picture_5.jpeg)






Copyright © 2015 All rights reserved